

LETTER TO THE EDITOR

Rebuttal to:

RESEARCH TRENDS OF SLUDGE TREATMENT BASED ON BIBLIOMETRIC ANALYSIS FROM 1992 TO 2009

Jianguo Liu, Qiuping Zhang, Shuli Zhang, Zhian Liu, Zhiyong Gao

Vol. 25, pp 3186-3192

Yuh-Shan Ho

Trend Research Centre, Asia University, No. 500, Lioufeng Road, Wufeng, Taichung County 41354, Taiwan

E-mail: ysho@asia.edu.tw

Liu et al. (2016) published the paper entitled “Past, current and future of biomass energy research: A bibliometric analysis”. The same paper was also published by Liu et al. (2015) in *BioTechnology: An Indian Journal*. It is not appropriate to publish the same paper in two journals. One of the most important reasons is that more senior researchers are needed to be reviewers for the same manuscript.

In Section MATERIALS AND METHOD, authors applied almost parts from published papers (Li and Ho, 2008; Han and Ho, 2011) without citing appropriate references.

The idea of Table 1 was early published in *Journal of Environmental Protection Science* (Ho, 2007), *Scientometrics* (Chiu and Ho, 2007), and *Ecological Engineering* (Zhang et al., 2010a). Tables 2 and 3 showed the idea of country and institute publications using total number of publications, independent publications, collaborative publications, first-author publications, and corresponding-author publications, which were firstly proposed by Ho and co-workers (Mao et al., 2010; Zhang et al., 2010b). Structure of Table 4 was copied from papers published in *Ecological Engineering* (Zhang et al., 2010a) and *Neuroscience and Biobehavioral Reviews* (Han and Ho, 2011). Ideal of Tables 5, 6, and 7 were copied from papers published in *Croatia Chemica Acta* (Li et al., 2009a), *Scientometrics* (Zhang et al., 2010b), and *Human and Ecological Risk Assessment* (Mao et al., 2010). In fact, the distribution of words in article title, author keywords, and *KeyWords Plus* with its rank and percentage in different Li, Z. and Ho, Y.S. (2008), Use of citation per publication as an indicator to evaluate contingent valuation research. *Scientometrics*, 75 (1), 97-110.

[1] Liu, J.G., Gao, Z.Y., Qiu, G.M., Liu, F. and Mei, Y. (2015), Research trends of sludge treatment based on bibliometric analysis from 1992 to 2009. *BioTechnology: An Indian Journal*, 11 (12), 447-455.

Liu, J.G., Zhang, Q.P., Zhang, S.L., Liu, Z. and Gao, Z.Y. (2016), Research trends of sludge periods has been firstly proposed in 2009 (Li et al., 2009b). Research trends by the frequency of author keywords, words in title, words in abstract, and *KeyWords Plus* was also presented in 2010 (Zhang et al., 2010b). Furthermore, a new method named “word cluster analysis” was successfully applied to find the research hotspots of a field (Mao et al., 2010; Fu et al., 2013).

Citing the original paper not only respects the authors who presented a novel idea in research, but also directs readers to the details of the original work (Ho, 2010). Plagiarism is defined as when the authors of a scientific publication duplicate previously published ideas, text, or figures in the scientific literature without any citation (Noè and Batten, 2006). In my view, Liu et al. should have cited the original papers for all indicators and concept of Tables, thereby providing greater accuracy and detailed information about the bibliometric concept that they employed.

REFERENCES

- [2] Chiu, W.T. and Ho, Y.S. (2007), Bibliometric analysis of tsunami research. *Scientometrics*, 73 (1), 3-17.
- [3] Fu, H.Z., Wang, M.H. and Ho, Y.S. (2013), Mapping of drinking water research: A bibliometric analysis of research output during 1992-2011. *Science of the Total Environment*, 443, 757-765.
- [4] Han, J.S. and Ho, Y.S. (2011), Global trends and performances of acupuncture research. *Neuroscience and Biobehavioral Reviews*, 35 (3), 680-687.
- [5] Ho, Y.S. (2007), Bibliometric analysis of adsorption technology in environmental science. *Journal of Environmental Protection Science*, 1 (1), 1-11.
- [6] Ho, Y.S. (2010), Letters to the editor. *Adsorption Science & Technology*, 28 (5), 465.

- [7] Li, J.F., Zhang, Y.H., Wang, X.S. and Ho, Y.S. (2009a), Bibliometric analysis of atmospheric simulation trends in meteorology and atmospheric science journals. *Croatica Chemica Acta*, 82 (3), 695-705.
- [8] Li, L.L., Ding, G.H., Feng, N., Wang, M.H. and Ho, Y.S. (2009b), Global stem cell research trend: Bibliometric analysis as a tool for mapping of trends from 1991 to 2006. *Scientometrics*, 80 (1), 39-58.
- [9] treatment based on bibliometric analysis from 1992 to 2009. *Fresenius Environmental Bulletin*, 25 (8), 3186-3192.
- [10] Mao, N., Wang, M.H. and Ho, Y.S. (2010), A bibliometric study of the trend in articles related to risk assessment published in Science Citation Index. *Human and Ecological Risk Assessment*, 16 (4), 801-824.
- [11] Noè, L.F. and Batten, D.J. (2006), 'Publish or perish': The pitfalls of duplicate publication. *Palaeontology*, 49 (6), 1365-1367.
- [12] Zhang, L., Wang, M.H., Hu, J. and Ho, Y.S. (2010a), A review of published wetland research, 1991-2008: Ecological engineering and ecosystem restoration. *Ecological Engineering*, 36 (8), 973-980.
- [13] Zhang, G.F., Xie, S.D. and Ho, Y.S. (2010b), A bibliometric analysis of world volatile organic compounds research trends. *Scientometrics*, 83 (2), 477-492.